

【翻訳】

荻生徂徠『弁名』「清廉不欲」の章の英訳

荻生徂徠『弁名』「節儉」の章の英訳

尾沼忠良・拝仙マイケル

Ogyû Sorai, *On Distinguishing Names*, Book 1,
Qing/Lian/Buyu.

Ogyû Sorai, *On Distinguishing Names*, Book 1,
Jie/Jian.

Tadayoshi ONUMA and Michael HUISSSEN

As in previous installments of this translation we depend on the erudition of Professor Nishida Taichirô the editor and translator of the edition of Sorai's *Benmei* 『弁名』 which appears in Iwanami's *Nihon Shisô Taikai*, and the editors of Meiji Shoin's *Shinshaku Kanbun Taikai*. Abbreviations can be found in previous installments of this translation.

キーワード：節儉、清廉、不欲、Jie、Qing

清廉不欲一則 *Qing/Lian/Buyu*: One Rule.

1. 清者謂不為惡所汚也。如伯夷陳文子。可以見已。不欲者寡欲也。謂不汚財利也。廉者廉隅之義。故謂取舍分辨截然也。後世遂以不汚財利為廉。後世之廉。即古之不欲也。學者察諸。

Rule 1. *Qing* (purity) means not becoming defiled by evil. What this means can be seen in the cases of Bo Yi¹ and Zhen Wenzi.² *Buyu* means having few

desires or reducing one's desires [guayu 寡欲].³ It means not becoming defiled by property or profit. *Lian* means *lianyu* [廉隅] (edges and corners) *i.e.* the ability to discriminate between the right and wrong of things, thus it means making a marked distinction between what one should accept and what one should not accept. Later ages ultimately made not becoming defiled by property or profit to mean *lian*. The *lian* of later ages is in other words the *buyu* of antiquity. Scholars, consider this well!

節儉二則 *Jie/Jian*: Two Rules.

1. 節者礼義之節也。礼義皆有所限而不可踰越者。是之謂節。節之云者。守其限而不敢踰越也。大節者。乃謂礼義之大限也。皆道之目也。自有聖達節次守節之言。而後世遂有節士節婦之称。以命其人之德已。

Rule 1. *Jie* [staying within bounds 節] is staying within the bounds prescribed by *li* and *yi* [礼義]. All *li* and *yi* prescribe limits. Not allowing oneself to exceed them is called staying within bounds. "Staying within the bounds of this"⁴ means defending this limit and not daring to exceed it. The "great *jie*" [大節]⁵ means the great limits of *li* and *yi*. All are aspects of the *dao*. "The sages all consummated *jie*; those directly below them heeded *jie*."⁶ This statement is the basis of the expressions 'man of *jie*' [節士] and 'woman of *jie*' [節婦] which were born in later ages, resulting in this term coming merely to designate that person's *de*.⁷

2. 儉者節用也。如温良恭儉讓。宋儒誤以為聖人之威儀。遂謂儉不止節用者。非矣。蓋儉者仁人之道也。王者之大德也。堯舜茅茨不剪。土階三尺。禹惡衣服。菲飲食。卑宮室。豈不然乎。孟子所謂仁民而愛物。蓋古言也。謂愛惜物也。因孟子又有愛牛之說。而宋儒誤以為慈愛之愛者。非也。数罟

不入洿池。斧斤以時入山林。皆不暴天物之義也。若徒以慈愛言之。則孰若浮屠之戒殺乎。孟子所以仁術言之者。欲以誘齊王。其好辯之失。率如是耳。

Rule 2. *Jian* [thrift, frugality 儉] is staying within the bounds (*jie*) of prudence. In an expression like "(the master is) *wen, liang, gong, jian, and rang*,"⁸ the Song Confucianists mistakenly took this to refer to the sages' meticulous observance of *li*. Ultimately they even said that *jian* is not merely a matter of staying within the bounds (*jie*) of prudence. This is an error. In my view *jian* is the *dao* of the man of *ren*. It is the great *de* of the (sage) kings. As for [the throne room of] Yao and Shun, its thatched eaves were not trimmed to size and its earthen stairway was but three feet high.⁹ Yu wore simple clothing, ate plain food, and lived in a lowly throne room.¹⁰ How could this be anything but its meaning! Mencius' words, "Give the people *ren* and treasure (*ai* 愛) things,"¹¹ are in my view used with their ancient connotation. They mean that one should value things. But based on the episode in *The Mencius* where the expression to "treasure an ox"¹² appears, the Song Confucianists mistakenly take 'treasure' (*ai* 愛) to mean compassion in the former case as well. This is an error. The statements, "Put not a fine-meshed net into a pond" and "put axes and hatchets into the mountain forests only at the proper time,"¹³ both mean that one should not injure the things of *Tian*.¹⁴ If these statements merely meant to have compassion then there is nothing to distinguish them from the Buddhist prohibition on killing. Mencius said this in order to entice the King of Qi to take up the "art of *ren*."¹⁵ His partiality to this type of argument often resulted in this kind of error.

如礼与其奢也寧儉。亦謂節用也。觀於今也純儉。可以見已。又曰。富而好礼。子路曰。傷哉貧也。生無以為養。死無以為礼也。曾子曰。国無道。君子恥盈礼焉。国奢則示之以儉。国儉則示之以礼。子思曰。有其礼無其財。君子弗行也。有其礼有其財無其時。君子弗行也。蓋礼必備物。貧則不可備

矣。雖不貧。然節其用而不必盈禮。是儉也。必欲備物而侈其用。是奢也。後儒不知本諸古言。徒謂儉者不及之謂。而欲就禮爭過不及。其論遂致弗通。學者察諸。

Statements like "rather than indulging in luxury in the performance of *li*, be *jian* (frugal)"¹⁶ also mean staying within the bounds of prudence. Consider the statement, "the recent use of silk (in crowns) is evidence of thrift"¹⁷ and you can see what I mean. It is also said, "They have become wealthy, yet remain partial to *li*."¹⁸ Zilu said, "It is a pitiful thing to be poor. When one's parents are alive, one can not support them; when they die one can not perform *li* properly."¹⁹ Cengzi [曾子] said, "If the country does not practice the *dao*, the *junzi* will feel shame at performing *li*. If the country indulges in luxury, he must point it toward frugality; if it is frugal, he must point it toward *li*."²⁰ Zisi said, "If there are *li* to perform but insufficient resources, then the *junzi* does not perform them. If there are *li* to perform and resources sufficient to perform them but the time is not right, then the *junzi* does not perform them."²¹ In my view, performing *li* requires that one assemble certain resources without fail. If one is poor one can not assemble them. Even if one is not poor, one cuts expenditures and does not necessarily perform *li*. This is *jian* (frugality). To wish without fail to assemble resources and wastefully expend them is indulging in luxury. Later Confucianists did not know what it means to base oneself on ancient words and to no purpose (vainly) said, "*Jian* (frugality) implies insufficiency,"²² and tried to contest whether *li* were overdone or done insufficiently. In the end this argument reached the point where it became incomprehensible. Scholars, consider this well!

Notes:

¹BMZ 5B.1. SKT 4.348-351. 「伯夷目不視惡色、耳不聽惡聲・・・伯夷、聖之清者也」 Bo Yi's eyes refused to see evil things, his ears to hear evil voices ... Of all the sages Bo Yi best represented *qing* (purity).

²BLY 5.19. SKT 1.118. 「崔子弑齊君、陳文子有馬十乘、棄而違之、・・・子曰、清矣」 When Cuizi assassinated the Lord of Qi, Zhen Wenzhi, though he had ten four-horse coaches (coach and four), left Qi leaving them all behind. ... Confucius said, 'This indeed is *qing* (purity).'

³Examples of the usage of *buyu* (不欲) can be found in BLY 12.18. SKT 1.274 and BLY 14.13. SKT 1.311-12. In Sorai's comment on the latter passage in *Rongochou* [OSZA 4.148 and 498] he uses the expression *buyu* (不欲), but here in *Benmei* the expression *guayu* (寡欲). In NST 36.574 Nishida comments on this saying that the apparent meaning of the expression *buyu* (不欲, no desire) is close to that of *muyu* (無欲, no desire), but in actuality that it is closer to *guayu* (寡欲, limited desire), i.e. for Confucianists desire must be limited but not, as with the Daoists, completely extinguished.

⁴BLY 1.12. SKT 1.31. GY 14.8.7. SKT 67.599. CCQZZ 10.1. SKT 32.1225.

⁵BLY 8.6. SKT 1.184. GY 4.1.4. SKT 66.230.

⁶CCQZZ 8.15. SKT 31.777.

⁷According to Kanaya Osamu NS 12, p. 236, Sorai is insisting here that *jie* 節 is not the name of a *de* 德 but another term for referring to the *dao*.

⁸BLY 1.10. SKT 1.28. 「夫子溫良恭儉讓」 The master is wen, liang, gong, jian, and rang.

According to Zhu Xi in ST 7.43 and 397. (『論語集注』)「学者觀於聖人威儀之間、亦可以進德矣」 Scholars view how the sages fulfilled detailed ceremonial requirements and thereby advance their *de*.

⁹SJ 27.16. SKT 89.484. 「堯之有天下也、堂高三尺、采椽不斷、茅茨不翦」 When Yao ruled all under *Tian*, the floor of the imperial palace was but three feet high, its rafters remained in log form bark unpeeled, and its thatched eaves were not trimmed to size.

¹⁰BLY 8.21. SKT 1.194.

¹¹BMZ 7A.45. SKT 4.481.

¹²BMZ 1A.7. SKT 4.29.

¹³BMZ 1A.3. SKT 4.15. A "fine-meshed net" so that the pond's stock of fish will never be exhausted. The "proper time" so that the forest can provide good lumber every year.

¹⁴CLJ 5. SKT 27.196.

¹⁵BMZ 1A.7. SKT 4.29.

¹⁶BLY 3.4 SKT 1.64.

¹⁷BLY 9.3. SKT 1.197. According to Zhu Xi in ST 7.165 and 414. (『朱子注』) In the past extremely fine hemp, which was very difficult to work, had been used to make the cloth for crowns. Later, the use of silk had simplified the production process and resulted in lower costs.

¹⁸BLY 1.15. SKT 1.33.

¹⁹CLJ 4. SKT 27.159.

²⁰CLJ 4. SKT 27.149.

²¹CLJ 3. SKT 27.121.

²²BLY 3.4 SKT 1.64. 「礼与其奢也寧儉、喪与其易也寧戚」 Rather than indulging in luxury in the performance of *li*, be *jian* (frugal); rather than emphasizing performance of funereal *li* to the letter, be true to its spirit.

According to Zhu Xi in ST 7.65 and 400. (『朱子注』) 「礼貴得中、奢易則過於文、儉戚則不及而質」 Following the mean in the performance of *li* is valued. To employ abundant resources in the performance of *li* to the letter is to indulge excessively in superficialities; to be frugal and true to the spirit (of *li*) is to go no further than essentials.